

REVIEWS

Az arabok és az iszlám (The Arabs and Islam. Selected Studies). [In Hungarian]. By IGNAZ GOLDZIHÉR. Edited with an Introduction by ISTVÁN ORMOS. (*Budapest Oriental Reprints*, edited by E. Schütz & É. Apor, A7-8.) 2 vols., Budapest: Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences & Csoma de Kőrös Society, 1995. xxi, 1090 pp. ISBN 963-7302-92-1.

The scholarly heritage of Ignaz Goldziher is of great value irrespective of the language he used. His writings in Hungarian, besides popularizing works of high standard, comprised scholarly articles which are often of prime importance even for the modern readers. The periodicals or collections, however, in which these articles had first been published are not easily available for the general public today. That is why the editor of the book, István Ormos, carried out an important mission by perusing, designating and preparing for publication those articles of Goldziher which are relevant from the point of view of Arabic studies. The articles thus selected fill two bulky volumes of the series of the Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. A part of these writings had originally been meant for the Hungarian public only, while another part contains preliminary Hungarian versions of articles that were to be published by Goldziher in foreign languages. Some articles which Goldziher had not published in foreign languages in his lifetime, were later on translated into English (e.g., *The Spanish Arabs*, *The History of Grammar*, and in the last years the *Memory of Renan to German*). Another sign of the Goldziher renaissance in Hungary is the publication of his Hungarian articles on Hebrew Studies last year, under the title *A zsidóság lényege és fejlődése (The Essence and Development of the Jewry)*, edited by János Kőbányai).

The present edition contains 28 articles written by Goldziher between 1873 and 1912. The titles in English are as follows: Volume One: *The Question of Nationality among the Arabs*; *Report on the Books Brought from the Orient for the Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences with Regard to Printing Conditions in the Orient*; *On Muhammadan Travellers*; *The Place of Spanish Arabs in the History of the Evolution of Islam as Compared with that of the Eastern Arabs*; *On the History of Grammar among the Arabs*; *The Oriental MSS in the Library of the Hungarian National Museum*; *On Popular Etymology in the Oriental Languages*; *On Muhammadan Public Opinion*; *On the Origins of the Muhammadan Jurisprudence*; *Abulwalīd*; *Commemorative Address in Memory of H. L. Fleischer*; *Journeys to Mecca*; *The Poet as Perceived by the Ancient Arabs*. Volume Two: *The Tradition of the Poetry of the Heathen Arabs*; *The Collection of Papyri of Archduke Rainer*; *Muhammadan Propaganda in America*; *Historiography in Arabic Literature*; *The Latest Literature on Arabic Dialects*; *From the Country of the Mahdi*; *Egyptian Islam*; *Islam up to the Fall of the Umayyads*; *The Influence of Buddhism upon Islam*; *The Arabs (Literary History)*; *Commemorative Address in Memory of Count*

Géza Kuun; János Uri; *In Memory of A. C. Barbier de Meynard and M. J. de Goeje; The Various Trends in Qur'ānic Exegesis.*

T. I.

"Machen Sie doch unseren Islam nicht gar zu schlecht". *Der Briefwechsel der Islamwissenschaftler Ignaz Goldziher und Martin Hartmann 1894-1914.* Edited and commented by LUDMILA HANISCH. (*Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur, Mainz, Veröffentlichungen der Orientalischen Kommission*, Hrsg. von Walter W. Müller, 45.) Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2000. xxvii, 465 pp., 7 plates. ISBN 3-447-0 4289-3.

The publication of the correspondence between I. Goldziher (1850-1921) and M. Hartmann (1851-1918) was a great undertaking, the difficulties of which are well illustrated by the two autograph letters at the end of the volume (Hartmann's writing is especially hard to read), and the enormous amount of notes which may be needed by the readers in order to fully comprehend the content of the correspondence. The editor of the volume, Ludmila Hanisch, engaged herself to work on a very demanding task, while thanks are also due to Harrassowitz for undertaking the publication. Reading through the volume it becomes apparent that the correspondence is characterised by a constant interchange of scholarly views, a part of which did not appear in the published works of the two scholars, their remarks are still quite interesting in a great number of cases, and not only from the point of view of the history of science. To mention only one point for the significance of this correspondence, I. Goldziher writes in his *Tagebuch*, p. 172 "Seit mehreren Wochen fleissige Correspondenz mit Prof. Martin Hartmann in Berlin über die Entwicklung der Metrik und Reimpoesie aus der homoteleutischen Prosa (Sağ) entwickelt".

The errors that have crept into this significant and praiseworthy work are belittled by the greatness of the undertaking. One thing, however, may not remain unmentioned by the reviewer, namely the peculiarities of the Arabic script used in this edition and the disturbing mistakes in it. E.g., instead of initial *š*, *s*, *ḍ*, *t*, *w* the medial forms are used (ط, ظ, ض, س, ش instead of ش, س, ض, ط, ظ), instead of final *y* the independent one (ي → ي) or vice versa, instead of initial-independent *alif* the numeral one (ا → ١), independent *hā'* is replaced by the numeral five (ه → ٥), an *alif* with a *hamza* several time gets a *šadda* as well (آ), etc. This latter sign is generally used incorrectly, since it is combined with a *kasra* (ـِ) irrespective of whether *i* or *a* should be meant, i.e. there is a total absence of *šadda* + *fatha* (ـَ). This is especially disturbing when the two scholars discuss the correct reading and cannot be justified by the editor's note at the bottom of the Contents! At the end of the words, the use of *yā'* (ي) and *alif maqṣūra* (ى) is also very clumsy and mixed, while *tanwīn damma* is used at various places within the words, among them on p. 29 where the vowelising of *أست* is discussed, so it is quite confusing to read this word twice in the same form

and once as **أست**. The unreliable and incorrect ways of writing are disturbing especially because in some cases it may be difficult to decide whether we face a typing error, or this strange and (at least for him) incomprehensible word form was written in the original letter. At these instances the reader would like to see the original and has a feeling of uncertainty concerning the use of the book, e.g. did Goldziher really write **كتبة مستعجلا** (?) (p. 19) or did Hartmann write **بموثد تعالی** (p. 117)? And what is to be meant on **باسملاة** (p. 103)? Perhaps **بسملة** or **بسملات**? On pp. 253 and 256 one should rather expect *qudwat al-milla* and not *qudrat al-milla*. On pp. 333 and 334 **بالسور** is written (which is right), while on p. 337 **سدر** (which could not be meant by Hartmann). How to interpret Hartmann's question on an invocation beginning with **الحمد لله**, mentioned thrice in various letters? etc. Considering the great number of typographical errors one becomes filled with uncertainty, for example, in case of Hartmann's correction on p. 332.

The errors are, however, insignificant compared with the merits of this edition, and one can only welcome this excellent book from which we get a picture of the interchange of ideas between these two outstanding scholars.

T. I.

Scienza e Islam. Atti della giornata di studio (Venezia, 30 gennaio 1999). Edited by GIOVANNI CANOVA. (*Quaderni di Studi Arabi. Studi e testi*, 3.) Roma: Herder Editrice for Università Ca' Foscari di Venezia, 1999. 112 pp. ISSN 1121-2306.

This interesting volume contains seven contributions that were presented at a Colloquium dedicated to *'ilm* (in its broadest sense) in Islam. Accordingly, the papers deal with a wide variety of subjects. A. Regourd examines the use of the esoteric science of letters (*'ilm al-ḥurūf*) to reveal the innermost meaning of geomancy (*darb ar-raml*) on the basis of two geomancers from North Yemen. A. Scarabel in his lexicological investigation tries to reveal the different meanings of terminology related to blood, especially the different meanings of coagulation and what follows from them. I. Zilio-Grandi analyses in detail Aḥmad at-Tifāšī's (1184-1253) *Kitāb azhār al-afkār fi ḡawābir al-aḥḡār* from the point of view of its sources. R. Tottoli deals with the *'aḡā'ib* literature, a topic further elaborated in the present volume by Sh. Habib. A. Ghersetti in her analysis of the *Kitāb al-firāsa* attributed to Polemon of Laodicea establishes that the assumed authorship must be discarded and that the real subject of the book is erotology. G. Canova examines in great detail the information about bees and honey in Arabic literature, starting from pre-Islamic poetry, the Qur'ān and its commentaries, the Prophet's *sunna*, and arriving through later sources (*Rasā'il Iḥwān aṣ-Ṣafā'*, the works of al-Ġāḥiḡ, ar-Rāzī, Ibn Sīnā, etc.) to beekeeping in 18th century Egypt and modern Yemen. The closing article of the volume is the presentation of a talismanic chart of the Tareq Rajab Museum (Kuwait) by A. Fodor. The

articles (mainly in Italian, one in French and one in English) of this excellent collection of essays are followed by brief summaries in English.

K. D.

The Malta Language Question. A Case Study in Cultural Imperialism. By GEOFFREY HULL. Introduction by Giulio Soravia. Valetta (Malta): Said International, 1993. 418 pp. ISBN 99909-43-08-7.

This book poses the question: Who are the Maltese and seeks satisfactory answers to it. It is a lengthy analysis of Malta's linguistic history through an interdisciplinary approach, that of a linguist writing history. The author studies the politicization of trilingualism (Maltese, Italian, English) in Malta from the second half of the 19th century till our days. Geoffrey Hull is the first to summarize the events of the Maltese language question in a comprehensive and thoroughly documented overview. He presents how the Italian culture of this insular country "disappeared" in the years preceding WW II and how it was replaced by the anglophone culture, while in the meantime powerful attempts have been made to turn Maltese, or its arabicised version, to be the main vehicle of culture in Malta. One thing established by the author is that in spite of the more than 800 years of Italian, then English, influence, the basic (lower and middle) layers of the inhabitants of the island, and more generally speaking, the inhabitants of the countryside, use the Semitic Maltese language in everyday communication.

Part One deals with the external history of the language question. Part Two speaks of the movement in defence of "Malta Italiana". Part Three is an evaluation of the relation of Great Britain and the 'New Malta'. Part Four bears the title "The Maltese in Context". Appendices (Maltese English; 'Maltese' Surnames in Sicily; Two Orthographies; Legal Maltese), a bibliography and an index of names make the volume complete.

T. I.

Arabic Verbs in Time: Tense and Aspect in Cairene Arabic. By JOHN C. EISELE. (*Semitica Viva*, Hrsg. von Otto Jastrow, 20.) Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1999. xiv, 264 pp. ISBN 3-447-04062-9.

John C. Eisele's book is the most comprehensive and most useful formal linguistic treatise on Arabic verbs hitherto written. The introductory chapter gives general information on the language data and previous works on tense and aspect in Arabic. Chapter Two deals with tense and time reference in English. The purpose of this chapter "is to provide a general framework in which to analyze tense and time reference in English in order to compare it with Cairene Arabic". This seems to define the main objective of this study, *i.e.* to give a contrastive analysis of English and

Arabic linguistic data, which may be very important for the speakers of English who are interested in Arabic and the speakers of Arabic interested in studying English. In that case it would have been better to indicate the scope of this study in the title as well. If, however, the author thinks that in the case of analyzing any language one should basically start one's investigation with a comparison of the target language with English, he may be wrong, since English is not the equivalent of a universal grammar, though it must be admitted that the majority of modern linguistic theories have been developed on the basis of English. Chapter Three concentrates on three categories of the formal aspect: event, process and state. Chapter Four speaks about the temporal and aspectual characteristics of the basic morphological verb forms in Cairene Arabic. Chapter Five deals with present time copular sentences in CA. Chapter Six focuses on compound tenses and complement types, while Chapter Seven is consecrated to the investigation of the lexical aspectual classification of verbs and predicates in CA. Chapter Eight is a summary dealing with the interaction of time reference, lexical aspect, and formal aspect in Cairene Arabic.

T. I.

Tempus und Aspekt in den semitischen Sprachen. Jenaer Kolloquium zur semitischen Sprachwissenschaft. Edited by NORBERT NEBES. (*Jenaer Beiträge zum Vorderen Orient*, 1.) Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1999. viii, 192 pp. ISBN 3-447-04257-5.

Freddie Beeston, in the end of August 1995 in Oxford explained his not coming to Budapest to take part in our conference on Arabic linguistics a fourth time by that he would go instead to Jena in October. Having died on the 29th of September 1995 (at the age of 84) he could not take part in that conference the excellence of which we now are convinced by reading its proceedings. This volume contains 13 articles. There is one article, which tries to give a theoretical framework for the papers of the conference: Adolf Denz: *Tempus und Aspekt? Vorstellung eines noetischen Modells*. Five papers deal with ancient Semitic languages: Michael P. Streck: *Das "Perfekt" iptaras im Altbabylonischen der Hammurapi-Briefe*; Josef Tropper: *Imperfektive Darstellung vergangener Sachverhalte im Ugaritischen*; Ingo Kottsieper: *"und mein Vater zog hinauf". Aspekte des älteren aramäischen Verbalsystems und seiner Entwicklung*; Stefan Weninger: *kona qatala zum Ausdruck der Vergangenheit im Ge'ez?* Stefan Bombeck: *Das syrische Verbalsystem: hypothetische Sätze und hwā vor Adjektiv oder Partizip*. Two concentrate on Modern Semitic dialects (other than Arabic): Werner Arnold: *Das Verbum in den neuwestaramäischen Dialekten*; Ewald Wagner: *Das Verb im alten und modernen Harari*. Two articles treat the Classical Arabic verbal system: Thomas Bauer: *Verben und Textpartikeln in altarabischen narrativen Texten*; Norbert Nebes: *Das Satzschema fa-hwwa yaf'alu/fā'ilun/Prädikativ für Vergangenheit in frühklassischer arabischer Erzählliteratur*. One paper is dedicated to a modern Arabic dialect: Otto Jastrow: *Verbformen und ihre Funktionen im ara-*

bischen Dialekt von Kendērib (Südostanatolien). Finally, there is one article which lies outside the main theme of the volume, dealing with Greek: Eva Tichy: Nicht nur Vordergrund und Hintergrund: Zum Aspektgebrauch im Neuen Testament und im homerischen Epos. It is only to be regretted that the papers are published in alphabetical order.

T. I.

Mehri Texts from Oman. Based on the Field Materials of T. M. Johnstone. By HARRY STROOMER. (*Semitica Viva*, Hrsg. von Otto Jastrow, 22.) Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1999. xxviii, 303 pp. ISBN 3-447-04215-X.

The volume comprises the 106 texts that formed the linguistic basis for the *Mehri Lexicon* of T. M. Johnstone. These texts, most of which are folk-tales, had been collected by Johnstone in 1969-70. The edition faithfully reproduces his transcription (checked and sometimes elucidated by the material on tape) and his translation, supplemented by a thorough introduction about the texts by the editor, H. Stroomer. Careful notes help students of Mehri in finding words in the *Mehri Lexicon*. It would also have served the reader had the editor undertaken the transcription of the missing ten lines from the incomplete tribal history of the Ḥarāsīs. Be as it may, since the texts are interesting in themselves, and not only as linguistic specimens, by making these texts available to the public H. Stroomer has done a great service not only to Semitists and Arabists, but also to a much wider public, to folklorists, ethnographers, and in general to all those who are interested in the region.

K. D.